



## Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact [support@jstor.org](mailto:support@jstor.org).

LXXXVII-CX on noun constructions may be omitted if necessary. If these directions are followed it would seem that much of the advantage claimed for the 'based on text' method must be lost. Certainly the vocabulary of the student must suffer.

Part II is by far the best part of the book; the latter portion of it, which treats of auxiliary verbs and prepositions, is particularly good.

Part III is based on Cicero's *Pro Murena*, *In Verrem*, and *Epistulae*. Just why these selections should be employed is not clear, for, notwithstanding the statement in the Introduction, the vocabulary is unfamiliar to the student and a fairly large percentage of the words used do not belong to a school vocabulary. References are made to a set of grammatical references in the back of the book which in turn refer the student to his grammar. There are on an average sixteen of these references to each exercise not counting the footnotes, which average twelve, and Lesson VIII caps the climax with forty-one grammatical references and thirteen footnotes.

HORACE MANN HIGH SCHOOL. ALEXANDER J. INGLIS.

The editors of *The Classical Weekly* have kindly given me permission to reply to the above review. While I greatly appreciate the courtesy, I hardly feel that a book needs vindication which has been before the public three years and has won the unqualified endorsement of hundreds of experienced teachers. Two influences have apparently conspired to prevent the reviewer from being as fair-minded as he doubtless wished to be: first, his well-known hostility to the method known as "writing Latin based on the text"; second, his different conception of the object of Latin composition teaching in secondary schools. As to the second of these points, I hold that in addition to a systematic and thorough study of syntax the Latin composition should assist the young student in interpreting the author he is reading. In accordance with this belief the vocabulary chosen in the exercises is that most directly necessary to the translation of his lesson from day to day—which seems to me quite the opposite of "hit-or-miss" and "haphazard"—and the syntax involved includes some of the difficult constructions as they occur in the text before they are formally treated in the lessons. In no case, I believe, has a difficult construction been anticipated, unless its presence in the text justifies its appearance in the parallel exercise. Its obvious value to the student at this point needs no defense. He gets the help he needs at the time he needs it. The reviewer, too, seems to ignore the fact that the student has studied Latin a year or more before taking up Caesar and is undoubtedly familiar with some of the fundamental constructions in their simplest form. For example,

in teaching sequence of tenses (Part I, § 109) it is assumed that the student knows something about the subjunctive of purpose and of result, but if his memory needs refreshing the basic chapter contains several examples of these constructions. This can hardly be called a case of anticipation. The subject of prohibitions is said to be anticipated in § 81, but the subject under discussion is the hortatory subjunctive, and negative sentences of this character having the force of a prohibition are surely in place here. There is, then, no anticipation.

The reviewer objects to the postponement of noun constructions. The syntax of nouns has formed a large part of the instruction during the first year. On the other hand the syntax of verbs has been but begun and must be learned as rapidly as possible with the reading of Caesar. Even after Caesar is finished, most of the errors in Latin writing are in the verbs and not in the nouns. Verbs should, therefore, be attacked first and emphasized throughout the second year. No doubt opinions will differ as to what verb constructions should be taught with Caesar, but I venture the assertion that few will sympathize with the wholesale elimination which the reviewer proposes. Especially unwise would be the omission of the uses of the subjunctive in independent sentences, as these are basic in their character and the source of the subordinate constructions.

Part III is designedly based on parts of Cicero not ordinarily read in high schools. Possibly one-fifth of the words do not belong to a school vocabulary, but what other basic text outside the curriculum can be suggested in which four-fifths do so belong? A wrong impression is given as to the number of references in this Part. The reviewer should have stated that each exercise consists of two parts, either of which may be chosen. That reduces the number at least fifty per cent.

Space forbids a discussion of the other criticisms made, but perhaps enough has been said to show that their refutation would be equally easy. I wish to add that I believe that the reviewer wished to be candid and impartial. I regret that he did not succeed.

BENJAMIN L. D'OOGHE

A History of Rome during the Later Republic and Early Principate. By A. H. J. Greenidge. Volume I: From the Tribune of Tiberius Gracchus to the Second Consulate of Marius, B. C. 133-104. New York: E. P. Dutton and Co. (1905). Pp. xii + 508.

The intention was to cover in six volumes the period from the Gracchi to the accession of Vespasian; but the death of the author soon after the publication of the first volume has unfortunately left the work unfinished. It is reported that he had

made little preparation for the remaining volumes, and the American publishers are unable to say whether any effort is being made to carry forward the original plan.

The period of the Republic which Dr. Greenidge hoped to include has been more thoroughly treated than any other part of Roman history. For example, Long's *Decline of the Roman Republic* in five volumes is a close reproduction of the source material with brief comment on its value and meaning; Neumann's *Geschichte Roms während des Verfalles der Republik*, though partisan, is stimulating and suggestive; Drumann's *Geschichte Roms*, now being revised by Gröbe, is an aggregate of biographies of the contemporaries of Pompey and Caesar. The well known histories of Mommsen and Ihne and a multitude of biographical and more special works might also be mentioned. These studies of a most interesting age, undertaken from various points of view, have prepared the ground for a careful, detailed summing up of results, such as the history now under discussion was to be. Dr. Greenidge was well equipped for the task. His *Roman Public Life* and his *Legal Procedure of Cicero's Time* both show a scholarly mind and a familiarity with the constitution and laws of the later Republic essential to the historian of the period. Those who have known him through these works are pleasantly surprised to find in his *History*, in addition to scholarship, a considerable degree of insight into life and of dramatic power in the presentation of the great characters. It is true that the first chapter, which in a hundred pages discusses the social and economic conditions surrounding the Gracchi, is heavy and at times obscure; but the second chapter, which begins the narrative of the Gracchan reforms, awakens the interest of the reader; and the student of the period, on reaching the year 104 B. C., regretfully parts company with the author. A good quality is his use of nearly all the literary and epigraphic sources, which he cites in footnotes. In his interpretation of them he takes account of the various possibilities of meaning, and rarely if ever seems to strain a statement to fit it to a preconceived view.

In judging a work of this kind, based as it is at many points on scant and uncertain material, a wide margin must be left for difference of opinion. Mommsen, Ihne, and Ferrero agree in declaring the deposition of a tribune unconstitutional; although Dr. Greenidge admits that the ousting of Octavius was without direct precedent, he refuses to pronounce it illegal. Nearly the same disagreement exists regarding the immediate re-election of a tribune. In favor of our author it must be said that almost all the powers ever exercised by the Roman assembly had been gained in the way in

which Ti. Gracchus was attempting to establish its right to depose officials and to re-elect tribunes—by precedent rather than by law. These instances illustrate the author's willingness to defend the conduct of the Gracchi. Even the law of Gaius for the taxation of Asia is favorably judged. While recognizing the incompleteness of the reforms of the two brothers, he grows eloquent, as well he may, over their personal character and their influence on the future history of their country. Henceforth "at every turn in the paths of political life the statesman was confronted by two figures, whom fear or admiration raised to gigantic proportions". In brief the author's treatment of these reformers is unexcelled in depth and sympathy. Marius in earlier life he regards as an ideal soldier, a man of uncouth appearance, "but with a massive reserve of strength, a persistence not blindly obstinate, a patience that could wear out the most brilliant efforts of his rivals and opponents", in politics a Manius Curius brought down from the heroic age of the Samnite wars to repeat his life in a period of degeneracy. It would have been interesting to follow with Dr. Greenidge the later career of this remarkable man and especially to analyze his leadership of the great proletarian uprising.

Few errors can be found anywhere in the volume. "Enactment" on p. 202 is merely a verbal mistake for "bill". On p. 237 the author makes this statement in relation to the reformed comitia centuriata: "As the votes of each century were separately taken and proclaimed, the absolute majority required for the decisions of the assembly might be attained without the inferior orders being called on to express their judgment". This is a more serious mistake. That the centuries all voted and that the votes were all reported is proved by overwhelming evidence. The ideas expressed on pp. 116, 138 as to the connection of the imperium with the judicial function and the auspices are confused. If under the Sempronian agrarian law, as under the later Servilian rogation, the commissioners were of pretorian rank, they certainly had imperium; but they could have exercised jurisdiction without it. The right of Tiberius to the auspices was not inherent in the imperium, if he had it, but was granted him by a special article of his law (Cicero, *De Leg. Agr.* 2.12.31). Objection ought also to be made to his opinion on another constitutional point, repeated from his *Legal Procedure*. It is hardly possible, as the author assumes on p. 201, that C. Gracchus gave capital jurisdiction to the assembly of tribes. An occasional error or confusion in a relatively minor point, however, detracts little from the value of the work as a whole. It is in fact the most thorough treatment of the period covered; although not brill-

iant like Ferrero's Greatness and Decline of Rome, it is far more substantial. There can be no doubt that it will long maintain its place as the chief authority for the subject treated. All who rightly appreciate the excellence of the work achieved must deeply regret the author's untimely death.

COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY. GEORGE WILLIS BOTSFORD

### A NEW CLASSICAL ASSOCIATION

The Classical Association of Pittsburgh and Vicinity was organized on November 9 last, under most favorable auspices. Since Greater Pittsburgh has become a reality the word 'vicinity' in the title of the Association includes Western Pennsylvania and adjacent territory in Ohio and West Virginia.

The object of the Association is to develop a larger appreciation of classical literature, to encourage more efficient instruction, and to unify the interests of classical teachers.

The officers of the Association are as follows: President, H. S. Scribner, Western University of Pennsylvania; Vice-Presidents, A. A. Haye of Washington and Jefferson College and J. B. Hench of Shadyside Academy, Pittsburgh; Secretary-Treasurer, Anna Petty, Carnegie High School, Carnegie, Pennsylvania.

At the meeting of November 23 Professor J. B. English, of Washington and Jefferson College, delivered an illustrated lecture on The Roman Forum in 1906. On January 11, 1908, the Association will be addressed by Professor W. A. Elliot, of Allegheny College, on A Day at Old Troy. The Association will hold six meetings a year. The outlook for its success is most hopeful.

CARNEGIE, PENN.

ANNA PETTY

A book not without interest to classical students is entitled Source Book in Ancient Philosophy, by Charles M. Bakewell, Professor of Philosophy in Yale University (Charles Scribner's Sons, 1907; pp. vii+395). The author has attempted to bring together translations in part original, in part borrowed, of the most significant documents bearing on the history of philosophy, and so to bring the student of philosophy into direct contact with the sources, so far as at least as that may be done through the medium of translations. Passages are given from a long array of philosophers, from Thales to Plotinus. To students of Lucretius and of Cicero's philosophical works who can not read Greek, the book is likely to prove decidedly useful. As the author notes, most of the sources from whom he quotes are already accessible in translation, but these translations are scattered through many volumes.

Mr. William Stearns Davis, whose book, A Friend of Caesar, attracted wide notice several years ago,

has turned his attention to ancient Greek life in a novel entitled, A Victor of Salamis, a tale of the days of Xerxes, Leonidas and Themistocles (The Macmillan Co., 1907). To criticize this as a novel is beyond the sphere of The Classical Weekly; to students of the Classics the book inevitably has interest in view of the important and fascinating period with which it deals. One thing the book does very well; it makes one feel, in some degree at least, the Greek horror of Medizing and Medizers.

### THE CLASSICAL WEEKLY

is published by The Classical Association of the Middle States and Maryland. It is issued weekly, on Saturdays, from October to May inclusive, except in weeks in which there is a legal or school holiday, at Teachers College (120th Street, West of Amsterdam Avenue), New York City.

All persons within the territory of the Association who are interested in the literature, the life and the art of ancient Greece and ancient Rome, whether actually engaged in teaching the Classics or not, are eligible to membership in the Association. Application for membership may be made to the Secretary-Treasurer, Charles Knapp, Barnard College, New York. The annual dues (which cover also subscription to THE CLASSICAL WEEKLY) are two dollars.

To persons outside the territory of the Association the subscription price of THE CLASSICAL WEEKLY is one dollar per year. Single copies are 10 cents each.

THE CLASSICAL WEEKLY is conducted by the following board of editors:

*Editor-in-Chief*

GONZALEZ LODGE, Teachers College, New York

*Associate Editors*

CHARLES KNAPP, Barnard College

ERNST RIESS, Boys' High School, Brooklyn

MITCHELL CARROLL, The George Washington University

*Business Manager*

GONZALEZ LODGE, Teachers College, New York

Communications, articles, reviews, queries, etc., should be sent to the editor-in-chief. Inquiries concerning subscriptions and advertising should be sent to the business manager.

**ROEHR PUBLISHING CO., PRINTERS**  
35 MYRTLE AVE., BROOKLYN

**HOTEL MARLBOROUGH**

36th Street and Broadway New York

The Famous German Restaurant. Broadway's Chief Attraction for Special Food Dishes and Popular Music.

SWEENEY, TIERNEY HOTEL CO. E. M. Tierney, Manager

**TOURS AND TICKETS EVERYWHERE**

Choice Staterooms by all Steamship Lines. Foreign Exchange. Travelers Checks. Correspondence invited. Tel. 1410 Stuyvesant.

**RAYMOND & WHITCOMB CO.**  
25 Union Square, New York

### A Ground-Floor Investment

Why be satisfied with four per cent. when you can make three or four times as much with us? Hundreds of teachers among our satisfied investors testify to splendid results. For a few weeks only we offer you the opportunity to join our company on the ground-floor by investing from \$100 up. The money is absolutely secured by valuable New York City real estate.

For particulars sign the attached coupon and send it to us to-day.

McNEECE, KISTLER & COMPANY, 150 Nassau St., New York City

MR. P. P. EDSON,  
Investment Department, Suite 804 150 Nassau St., N.Y.  
DEAR SIR—Without creating any obligations on my part, kindly send full particulars regarding the investment mentioned above.

Name.....

Address.....